



# VET05-R

## Generation, Presentation, and Application of Antimicrobial Susceptibility Test Data for Bacteria of Animal Origin; A Report

This report offers guidance on areas in which harmonization can be achieved in veterinary antimicrobial surveillance programs with the intent of facilitating comparison of data among surveillance programs.

A CLSI report for global application.

# Clinical and Laboratory Standards Institute

*Setting the standard for quality in medical laboratory testing around the world.*

The Clinical and Laboratory Standards Institute (CLSI) is a not-for-profit membership organization that brings together the varied perspectives and expertise of the worldwide laboratory community for the advancement of a common cause: to foster excellence in laboratory medicine by developing and implementing medical laboratory standards and guidelines that help laboratories fulfill their responsibilities with efficiency, effectiveness, and global applicability.

## Consensus Process

Consensus—the substantial agreement by materially affected, competent, and interested parties—is core to the development of all CLSI documents. It does not always connote unanimous agreement, but does mean that the participants in the development of a consensus document have considered and resolved all relevant objections and accept the resulting agreement.

## Commenting on Documents

CLSI documents undergo periodic evaluation and modification to keep pace with advancements in technologies, procedures, methods, and protocols affecting the laboratory or health care.

CLSI's consensus process depends on experts who volunteer to serve as contributing authors and/or as participants in the reviewing and commenting process. At the end of each comment period, the committee that developed the document is obligated to review all comments, respond in writing to all substantive comments, and revise the draft document as appropriate.

Comments on published CLSI documents are equally essential, and may be submitted by anyone, at any time, on any document. All comments are managed according to the consensus process by a committee of experts.

## Appeals Process

When it is believed that an objection has not been adequately considered and responded to, the process for appeals, documented in the CLSI Standards Development Policies and Processes, is followed.

All comments and responses submitted on draft and published documents are retained on file at CLSI and are available upon request.

## Get Involved—Volunteer!

Do you use CLSI documents in your workplace? Do you see room for improvement? Would you like to get involved in the revision process? Or maybe you see a need to develop a new document for an emerging technology? CLSI wants to hear from you. We are always looking for volunteers. By donating your time and talents to improve the standards that affect your own work, you will play an active role in improving public health across the globe.

For additional information on committee participation or to submit comments, contact CLSI.

Clinical and Laboratory Standards Institute  
950 West Valley Road, Suite 2500  
Wayne, PA 19087 USA  
P: +1.610.688.0100  
F: +1.610.688.0700  
[www.clsi.org](http://www.clsi.org)  
[standard@clsi.org](mailto:standard@clsi.org)

ISBN 1-56238-765-0 (Print)  
ISBN 1-56238-766-9 (Electronic)  
ISSN 1558-6502 (Print)  
ISSN 2162-2914 (Electronic)

VET05-R  
Vol. 31 No. 17  
Formerly X08-R  
Vol. 31 No. 17

## Generation, Presentation, and Application of Antimicrobial Susceptibility Test Data for Bacteria of Animal Origin; A Report

Volume 31 Number 17

Shabbir Simjee, PhD  
Robert E. Badal  
William B. Brasso  
David J. Farrell, PhD, D(ABMM), FCCM  
Amy B. Frey, DO, MS  
Patrick McDermott, PhD  
Ron A. Miller, PhD  
Lori T. Moon, MT(ASCP)  
Florencia L. Pantozzi

Stefan Schwarz, DVM  
Albert T. Sheldon, Jr., PhD  
Thomas R. Shryock, PhD  
Peter Silley, PhD  
John Stelling, MD, MPH  
Bernd Stephan, PhD  
John D. Turnidge, MD  
Jeffrey L. Watts, PhD, RM(NRCM)  
Ching Ching Wu, DVM, PhD

### Abstract

Clinical and Laboratory Standards Institute document VET05-R—*Generation, Presentation, and Application of Antimicrobial Susceptibility Test Data for Bacteria of Animal Origin; A Report* offers guidance on areas in which harmonization can be achieved in national veterinary antimicrobial surveillance programs, with the intent of facilitating comparisons of data among various national surveillance programs. CLSI veterinary antimicrobial susceptibility testing (VAST) methods are used to generate minimal inhibitory concentrations or zones of inhibition, and the laboratory interprets that information into a category of susceptible, intermediate, or resistant. The veterinarian uses this information to make an informed decision in the selection of an appropriate antimicrobial for animal treatment. However, various surveillance programs or projects use the data for many other purposes, including the drafting of risk assessments (subsequently used for risk management) or to determine the success of intervention policies. These programs include multiple national programs, several multinational programs, product-specific programs, and purpose-specific regional or local programs. Currently, there is a lack of standardized methodology describing how the data from these programs are presented in the reports and discussed with regard to the specific program objective. In keeping with the intent of CLSI document M39,<sup>1</sup> this document seeks to bring the CLSI VAST perspective to these programs and projects by means of a comprehensive report that can help form the basis for a global consensus.

Clinical and Laboratory Standards Institute (CLSI). *Generation, Presentation, and Application of Antimicrobial Susceptibility Test Data for Bacteria of Animal Origin; A Report*. CLSI document VET05-R (ISBN 1-56238-765-0 [Print]; ISBN 1-56238-766-9 [Electronic]). Clinical and Laboratory Standards Institute, 950 West Valley Road, Suite 2500, Wayne, Pennsylvania 19087 USA, 2011.

The Clinical and Laboratory Standards Institute consensus process, which is the mechanism for moving a document through two or more levels of review by the health care community, is an ongoing process. Users should expect revised editions of any given document. Because rapid changes in technology may affect the procedures, methods, and protocols in a standard or guideline, users should replace outdated editions with the current editions of CLSI documents. Current editions are listed in the CLSI catalog and posted on our website at [www.clsi.org](http://www.clsi.org). If your organization is not a member and would like to become one, and to request a copy of the catalog, contact us at: Telephone: 610.688.0100; Fax: 610.688.0700; E-Mail: [customerservice@clsi.org](mailto:customerservice@clsi.org); Website: [www.clsi.org](http://www.clsi.org).



CLINICAL AND  
LABORATORY  
STANDARDS  
INSTITUTE®

Copyright ©2011 Clinical and Laboratory Standards Institute. Except as stated below, any reproduction of content from a CLSI copyrighted standard, guideline, companion product, or other material requires express written consent from CLSI. All rights reserved. Interested parties may send permission requests to [permissions@clsi.org](mailto:permissions@clsi.org).

CLSI hereby grants permission to each individual member or purchaser to make a single reproduction of this publication for use in its laboratory procedure manual at a single site. To request permission to use this publication in any other manner, e-mail [permissions@clsi.org](mailto:permissions@clsi.org).

### **Suggested Citation**

CLSI. *Generation, Presentation, and Application of Antimicrobial Susceptibility Test Data for Bacteria of Animal Origin; A Report*. CLSI document VET05-R. Wayne, PA: Clinical and Laboratory Standards Institute; 2011.

**Reaffirmed:**  
April 2016

ISBN 1-56238-765-0 (Print)  
ISBN 1-56238-766-9 (Electronic)  
ISSN 1558-6502 (Print)  
ISSN 2162-2914 (Electronic)

## Contents

Abstract.....	i
Committee Membership.....	iii
Foreword.....	vii
1 Scope.....	1
2 Introduction.....	2
3 Standard Precautions.....	3
4 Terminology.....	3
4.1 A Note on Terminology.....	3
4.2 Definitions.....	3
4.3 Abbreviations and Acronyms.....	5
5 Methods for Establishing Breakpoints.....	6
5.1 Clinical Breakpoint Setting.....	6
5.2 Epidemiological Cutoff Values.....	7
5.3 Methods to Determine Epidemiological Cutoff Values.....	9
5.4 Use of Epidemiological Cutoff Values in the Published Literature.....	10
6 Interpretation of Antimicrobial Susceptibility Test Data.....	11
6.1 Application of Clinical Breakpoints and Epidemiological Cutoff Values.....	11
6.2 Review of Data Generated From Modified CLSI Methods.....	13
6.3 Issues Related to the Interpretation of Minimal Inhibitory Concentrations.....	16
7 Common Designs of Human Origin Bacterial Antimicrobial Resistance Surveillance Programs – A Learning Point for Veterinary Surveillance Programs.....	17
8 Sampling Considerations for Monitoring Resistance in Zoonotic Enteric Pathogens.....	28
8.1 Sample Size.....	29
8.2 Number of Organisms.....	30
9 Analysis and Presentation of Antimicrobial Susceptibility Test Results.....	30
9.1 Isolate Listings for Important or Unlikely Resistance Phenotypes.....	30
9.2 Statistics for Susceptibility Test Interpretations.....	30
9.3 Frequency Distributions of Susceptibility Test Measurements.....	31
9.4 Additional Minimal Inhibitory Concentration Statistics.....	35
9.5 Antimicrobial Coresistance and Cross-Resistance.....	37
9.6 Data Stratification.....	38
9.7 Statistical Considerations.....	39
10 Multidrug Resistance.....	40
10.1 Considerations for Defining Multidrug Resistance.....	41
11 Recommendations for Encouraging International Surveillance Harmonization.....	44
References.....	45
Appendix. Statistical Methods for Examining Percent Susceptible.....	48

**Contents (Continued)**

The Quality Management System Approach .....54

Related CLSI Reference Materials .....55

SAMPLE

## Foreword

Owing to the large number of national antimicrobial resistance (AMR) surveillance programs, harmonization among these various programs is becoming increasingly important. The aim of this report is to provide the perspective of the Subcommittee on Veterinary Antimicrobial Susceptibility Testing on the generation, presentation, and application of antimicrobial susceptibility testing (AST) data for bacteria of animal origin regarding these programs, and perhaps help form the basis for a global consensus.

This report provides guidance on aspects of AMR surveillance programs ranging from sample collection, AST methodology, data presentation, and data interpretation, including situations in which CLSI-approved veterinary-specific clinical breakpoints are not established. Efforts are made to highlight areas in which laboratories deviate from CLSI methodology and the subsequent misinterpretation of data that can occur. Comparisons are made among some of the more established veterinary AMR surveillance programs and among human AMR surveillance programs, along with indications of the usefulness of certain points of human AMR programs for veterinary programs. The anticipated users of this document are surveillance program managers, regulatory authorities, clinical laboratories, and academicians.

## Key Words

Clinical breakpoints, coresistance, cross-resistance, epidemiological cutoff values, geometric mean, harmonization, MIC<sub>50</sub>, MIC<sub>90</sub>, multidrug resistance, surveillance

SAMPLE

# Generation, Presentation, and Application of Antimicrobial Susceptibility Test Data for Bacteria of Animal Origin; A Report

## 1 Scope

This report provides a review of current applications of susceptibility test data generated using CLSI methodology for bacteria of animal origin and recommendations for summarizing, presenting, and applying the data. More specifically, the report provides an overview of the CLSI veterinary antimicrobial susceptibility testing (VAST) approach to the use of reference methodology, quality control (QC), and establishment and use of clinical breakpoints and epidemiological cutoff values (ECVs). Recommendations for the presentation of minimal inhibitory concentrations (MICs) or zone inhibition data in frequency histograms and scatter plots are provided, in addition to recommendations for the use of ECVs and/or CLSI clinical breakpoints. A review of various applications of surveillance programs is provided, with clarification of descriptive summary statistics of MIC frequency histograms (eg, MIC<sub>50</sub>, MIC<sub>90</sub>, geometric mean), and recommended standardized approaches.

The report also provides a review of several select programs that monitor antimicrobial susceptibility in bacteria of animal origin (eg, Canadian Integrated Program for Antimicrobial Resistance Surveillance [CIPARS], Centre Européen d'Etudes pour la Santé Animale [CEESA], Danish Integrated Antimicrobial Resistance Monitoring and Research Programme [DANMAP], GERM-Vet, Monitoring of Antimicrobial Resistance and Antibiotic Usage in Animals in the Netherlands [MARAN], US National Antimicrobial Resistance Monitoring System [NARMS]) with regard to methods and data presentation and interpretation. For comparison purposes, a similar review is provided for programs monitoring antimicrobial susceptibility in bacteria of human origin (eg, European Antimicrobial Resistance Surveillance Network [EARS-Net], SENTRY Antimicrobial Surveillance Program). This report is not intended to provide guidance for human antimicrobial surveillance programs.

Finally, consideration is given to the intended use of any antimicrobial resistance (AMR) surveillance program. The usual goal in collecting antimicrobial susceptibility data is to detect the early emergence of resistance for a given bacterial species/antimicrobial combination that may be used for the following purposes:

- Provide a basis for policy recommendations for animal and public health.
- Generate data that may guide the design of further studies.
- Provide information for prescribing practices and prudent-use recommendations.
- Determine the prevalence or trend in prevalence of reduced susceptibility (or resistance) to a certain antimicrobial in a defined population.
- Detect emergence of AMR (eg, particular phenotypes).
- Identify the need for potential intervention.
- Assess the impact of intervention(s).
- Identify the emergence of new mechanisms of resistance.



## 2 Introduction

Although there are many veterinary AMR surveillance programs throughout the world, the lack of harmonization in sampling, susceptibility testing methods, antimicrobial agents tested, interpretive criteria, and reporting often makes it difficult to compare data across programs.<sup>2</sup> One significant problem is the use of the term *resistant* to categorize bacteria whose susceptibility properties are determined using often incompatible laboratory parameters, namely, clinical breakpoints and ECVs. This confusion of terms often precludes a direct comparison of reported resistance patterns in different locales. This problem is further exacerbated by the use of different clinical breakpoints and ECVs in different countries. In addition, the term *resistant* often is used loosely to indicate *decreased susceptibility*, *a non-wild type*, *increased MICs*, or *acquired genetic markers*, or to designate a physiological change in the cell affecting antimicrobial metabolism. In addition, it is not uncommon for studies to report resistance patterns using invalid testing methods or illegitimate modifications of standardized methods. These factors confound data interpretation and comparison, and serve to highlight the need for consensus terminology and method harmonization when possible.

Franklin et al.<sup>3</sup> published a guideline on the harmonization of national AMR monitoring and surveillance programs in animals and animal-derived foods on behalf of the Office International des Epizooties (OIE). The objective of the guideline was to allow the generation of comparable data from national surveillance and monitoring systems in order to compare the situations in different regions or countries and to consolidate results at the national, regional, and international levels. The guideline emphasized that in order to achieve comparability of results; the following factors should be taken into account for the design of such programs:

- Animal species/categories (including age) to be sampled
- For food sampling, the relative merits of sampling at the abattoir and retail outlet should be considered. In addition to food of domestic origin, food of foreign origin may also be considered, possibly at the port of entry of the products.
- Sampling strategy to be employed, eg, active or passive collection of samples; random, stratified, or systematically collected samples; statistically based sampling; or opportunistic sampling
- Samples to be collected (feces, carcass, raw and/or processed food)
- Bacterial species to be isolated
- Antimicrobial agents to be used in susceptibility testing
- Standardized susceptibility testing
- QC and quality assurance (QA)
- Type of quantitative data to be reported
- Database design for appropriate data extraction
- Analysis and interpretation of data, which is especially important in regard to how resistance is defined
- Reporting (consideration of transparency of reporting and interests of stakeholders)

## The Quality Management System Approach

Clinical and Laboratory Standards Institute (CLSI) subscribes to a quality management system approach in the development of standards and guidelines, which facilitates project management; defines a document structure via a template; and provides a process to identify needed documents. The quality management system approach applies a core set of “quality system essentials” (QSEs), basic to any organization, to all operations in any health care service’s path of workflow (ie, operational aspects that define how a particular product or service is provided). The QSEs provide the framework for delivery of any type of product or service, serving as a manager’s guide. The QSEs are as follows:

Organization	Personnel	Process Management	Nonconforming Event Management
Customer Focus	Purchasing and Inventory	Documents and Records	Assessments
Facilities and Safety	Equipment	Information Management	Continual Improvement

VET05-R addresses the QSE indicated by an “X.” For a description of the other documents listed in the grid, please refer to the Related CLSI Reference Materials section on the following page.

Organization	Customer Focus	Facilities and Safety	Personnel	Purchasing and Inventory	Equipment	Process Management	Documents and Records	Information Management	Nonconforming Event Management	Assessments	Continual Improvement
		M29				X M31 M37 M39 M42 M42/M49-S1 M49					

### Path of Workflow

A path of workflow is the description of the necessary processes to deliver the particular product or service that the organization or entity provides. A laboratory path of workflow consists of the sequential processes: preexamination, examination, and postexamination and their respective sequential subprocesses. All laboratories follow these processes to deliver the laboratory’s services, namely quality laboratory information.

VET05-R does not address any of the clinical laboratory path of workflow steps indicated in the grid below. For a description of the documents listed in the grid, please refer to the Related CLSI Reference Materials section on the following page.

Preexamination				Examination			Postexamination	
Examination ordering	Sample collection	Sample transport	Sample receipt/processing	Examination	Results review and follow-up	Interpretation	Results reporting and archiving	Sample management
				M31	M31 M42 M42/M49-S1 M49 M100	M31 M42 M42/M49-S1 M49 M100	M31 M42 M42/M49-S1 M49 M100	

## Related CLSI Reference Materials\*

- M29-A3**      **Protection of Laboratory Workers From Occupationally Acquired Infections; Approved Guideline—Third Edition (2005).** Based on US regulations, this document provides guidance on the risk of transmission of infectious agents by aerosols, droplets, blood, and body substances in a laboratory setting; specific precautions for preventing the laboratory transmission of microbial infection from laboratory instruments and materials; and recommendations for the management of exposure to infectious agents.
- M31-A3**      **Performance Standards for Antimicrobial Disk and Dilution Susceptibility Tests for Bacteria Isolated From Animals; Approved Standard—Third Edition (2008).** This document provides the currently recommended techniques for antimicrobial agent disk and dilution susceptibility testing, criteria for quality control testing, and interpretive criteria for veterinary use.
- M37-A3**      **Development of *In Vitro* Susceptibility Testing Criteria and Quality Control Parameters for Veterinary Antimicrobial Agents; Approved Guideline—Third Edition (2008).** This document addresses the required and recommended data needed for selection of appropriate interpretive standards and quality control guidance for new veterinary antimicrobial agents.
- M39-A3**      **Analysis and Presentation of Cumulative Antimicrobial Susceptibility Test Data; Approved Guideline—Third Edition (2009).** This document describes methods for recording and analysis of antimicrobial susceptibility test data, consisting of cumulative and ongoing summaries of susceptibility patterns of clinically significant microorganisms.
- M42-A**      **Methods for Antimicrobial Disk Susceptibility Testing of Bacteria Isolated From Aquatic Animals; Approved Guideline (2006).** This document provides the most up-to-date techniques for disk diffusion susceptibility testing of aquatic species isolates, and criteria for quality control testing.
- M49-A**      **Methods for Broth Dilution Susceptibility Testing of Bacteria Isolated From Aquatic Animals; Approved Guideline (2006).** This document provides the most up-to-date techniques for the determination of minimal inhibitory concentrations (MICs) of aquatic bacteria by broth micro- and macrodilution, and criteria for quality control testing.
- M42/M49-S1**      **Performance Standards for Antimicrobial Susceptibility Testing of Bacteria Isolated From Aquatic Animals; First Informational Supplement (2010).** This document provides updated tables for the Clinical and Laboratory Standards Institute antimicrobial susceptibility testing guidelines M42-A and M49-A.
- M100-S21**      **Performance Standards for Antimicrobial Susceptibility Testing; Twenty-First Informational Supplement (2011).** This document provides updated tables for the Clinical and Laboratory Standards Institute antimicrobial susceptibility testing standards M02-A10 and M07-A8.

---

\* CLSI documents are continually reviewed and revised through the CLSI consensus process; therefore, readers should refer to the most current editions.

# Explore the Latest Offerings From CLSI!

As we continue to set the global standard for quality in laboratory testing, we are adding products and programs to bring even more value to our members and customers.



By becoming a CLSI member, your laboratory will join 1,600+ other influential organizations all working together to further CLSI's efforts to improve health care outcomes. You can play an active role in raising global laboratory testing standards—in your laboratory, and around the world.

Find out which membership option is best for you at [www.clsi.org/membership](http://www.clsi.org/membership).



Find what your laboratory needs to succeed! CLSI U provides convenient, cost-effective continuing education and training resources to help you advance your professional development. We have a variety of easy-to-use, online educational resources that make eLearning stress-free and convenient for you and your staff.

See our current educational offerings at [www.clsi.org/education](http://www.clsi.org/education).



When laboratory testing quality is critical, standards are needed and there is no time to waste. eCLIPSE™ Ultimate Access, our cloud-based online portal of the complete library of CLSI standards, makes it easy to quickly find the CLSI resources you need.

Learn more and purchase eCLIPSE at [clsi.org/eCLIPSE](http://clsi.org/eCLIPSE).

For more information, visit [www.clsi.org](http://www.clsi.org) today.

# SAMPLE



CLINICAL AND  
LABORATORY  
STANDARDS  
INSTITUTE®

950 West Valley Road, Suite 2500, Wayne, PA 19087 USA

P: 610.688.0100 Toll Free (US): 877.447.1888 F: 610.688.0700

E: [customerservice@clsi.org](mailto:customerservice@clsi.org) [www.clsi.org](http://www.clsi.org)

PRINT ISBN 1-56238-765-0

ELECTRONIC ISBN 1-56238-766-9